**ORIGINAL PAPER**



# **Photocatalytic degradation of vancomycin using titanium dioxide and optimization by central composite design**

F. Dehghani<sup>1</sup> · S. Yousefinejad<sup>2</sup> · M. Dehghani<sup>3</sup> · S. M. Borghei<sup>4</sup> · A. H. Javid<sup>5</sup>

Received: 8 May 2021 / Revised: 30 August 2021 / Accepted: 13 March 2022

© The Author(s) under exclusive licence to Iranian Society of Environmentalists (IRSEN) and Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University 2022

### **Abstract**

Conventional wastewater treatment processes are not completely efective in removing vancomycin. In this study, afecting parameters on vancomycin degradation, such as pH, catalyst, initial vancomycin concentration, temperature, and reaction time were investigated simultaneously during a removal process based on titanium dioxide with ultraviolet irradiation in an aqueous solution. Titanium dioxide was synthesized and characterized using X-ray difraction and scanning electron microscopy. The average size of the synthesized crystals was  $4.7 (\pm 0.2)$  nm. Design of experiments was done by a central composite design based on the response surface methodology and multiple linear regression was implemented to construct the fnal model and evaluate the design. The total sum square values of the model were compared with the total sum squares of the error (residual) using Analysis of Variance.  $R^2$  in the final model was 0.92, which was close to  $R^2_{\text{adj}}$  (0.88). The optimal values of vancomycin degradation (pH = 5.1, initial concentration of vancomycin = 58.2 mg l<sup>-1</sup>, titanium dioxide = 54.9 mg in 250 ml reactor, temperature = 39.6 °C, time = 36.3 min) were obtained. Vancomycin degradation efficiency with the ultraviolet application was 89.5% which reached 93% with aeration and 25% without ultraviolet. After twice catalyst reuse, it was decreased from 89.5 to 80% and 78%. According to the results, obtained optimal conditions during treatment by titanium dioxide is an acceptable way to eliminate vancomycin in pharmaceutical industries wastewater, in high concentrations and mild-acidic pH, which does not require high temperatures and much time.

Keywords Antibiotic · Advanced oxidation process · Aqueous solution · Photocatalysis · Removal efficiency · Response surface methodology

Editorial responsibility: Samareh Mirkia.

 $\boxtimes$  S. M. Borghei mborghei@sharif.edu

- <sup>1</sup> Department of Environmental Engineering, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University (IAU), Tehran, Iran
- <sup>2</sup> Research Center for Health Sciences, Institute of Health, Department of Occupational Health Engineering, School of Health, Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Shiraz, Iran
- Department of Environmental Health Engineering, School of Health, Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Shiraz, Iran
- <sup>4</sup> Chemical and Petroleum Engineering Department, Sharif University of Technology, P.O. Box 11155-1399, Tehran, Iran
- <sup>5</sup> Department of Environmental Engineering, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

# **Introduction**

According to the Centers for Disease Control and prevention (CDC) in the United States, 28,000 deaths from antibiotic resistance occur annually, and 2 million Americans are infected with these bacteria annually (Martens and Demain [2017\)](#page-10-0). In European Union Countries, Vancomycin resistance has been reported from 0.0 to 59.1% during 2014–2018 (Piezzi et al. [2020](#page-10-1)). In the United States, at least 23,000 people die each year due to hospital infections (Nishiyama et al. [2017\)](#page-10-2) moreover, Fifty-fve thousand cases of Vancomycin-resistant enterococci (VRE) infections were reported in the United States in 2017 (Abutaleb et al. [2021](#page-9-0)). There are known subdivisions of Antibiotics such as Quinolones, β-lactams, Tetracyclines, Macrolides and Glycopeptides that, Vancomycin represents a group of glycopeptides which has a high molecular chain (Antunes et al. [2017\)](#page-9-1). Excessive application of Vancomycin, which has no significant effect on gram-negative species, will lead to VRE with serious concern for *Enterococcus*  *faecalis* and *Enterococcus faecium* (Herrero et al. [2002;](#page-10-3) Varela et al. [2013](#page-10-4)). Currently Vancomycin is the last line of defense against infections caused by gram-positive pathogenic bacteria (Dinu et al. [2020](#page-9-2); Melese et al. [2020\)](#page-10-5), that it is used mainly in infections caused by Staphylococcus aureus and Enterococcus spp., where the microorganism is completely resistant to treatment or when the patient is allergic to penicillin. However, there is not much knowledge about the presence and efects of Vancomycin in the environment (Antunes et al. [2017](#page-9-1)). Reported studies have not specifcally focused on Vancomycin degradation. Various concentrations of Vancomycin have been found in the aquatic environment and long-term shelf life in natural water has also been reported (Lofrano et al. [2014](#page-10-6)). Wastewater treatment processes are not completely effective in removing Vancomycin, so municipal wastewater can be a way for Vancomycin to enter surface water. Vancomycin and its degradation products in aquatic environments may lead to destructive efects on the environment and human health. Vancomycin, as an antibiotic, may also cause acute or chronic toxic poisoning of bacteria, algae, invertebrates, and fish in the aquatic environment (Cao et al. [2018\)](#page-9-3). The highest Vancomycin concentrations in the wastewater entering the treatment plant and the sludge were  $54.90 \pm 5.97$  and  $46.32 \pm 3.60$  mg  $1^{-1}$ , respectively (Qiu et al. [2016\)](#page-10-7). Hospitals play an important role in the spread of antibiotic-resistant bacteria which enter the sewer system and spread to the environment (Hocquet et al. [2016;](#page-10-8) Sib et al. [2019](#page-10-9); Wei et al. [2020](#page-11-0)). The level of antibiotics in surface waters is ng  $l^{-1}$  and mg  $l^{-1}$  in the hospital wastewater and the concentration of many antibiotics in the soil ranges from ng kg<sup>-1</sup> soil to hundreds of µg kg<sup>-1</sup> soil (Cycoń et al. [2016](#page-9-4)). One of the ways to remove antibiotics in aquatic environments is Advanced Oxidation Processes (AOP). The AOP<sub>s</sub> processes are UV, UV/O<sub>3</sub>, UV/H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, TiO<sub>2</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, Fe<sup>2+</sup>/  $H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>$ , UV/TiO<sub>2</sub> which are used individually or in combination together (Kurt et al. [2017\)](#page-10-10). The main mechanism of advanced oxidation processes is based on the production of hydroxyl radicals that are almost capable of oxidizing many organic compounds (Fazilati  $2019$ ). The Titanium dioxide (TiO<sub>2</sub>) photocatalyst is a semiconductor photocatalyst with a broad band gap (3.2 eV) and has been successfully utilized for the treatment of organic environmental pollutants. The clear reaction mechanism of the  $TiO<sub>2</sub>/UV$  process is shown in the following reactions (Kurt et al. [2017\)](#page-10-10).

$$
TiO2 + h\nu \rightarrow e-CB + h + VB
$$
 (1)

$$
H_2O + h + VB \rightarrow OH^{\cdot} + H^+ \tag{2}
$$

$$
O_2 + e^- CB \rightarrow O_2^- \tag{3}
$$

$$
O_2^- + H_2O \to OH^{\cdot} + OH^{\cdot} + O_2 + HO_2^{\cdot}
$$
 (4)

 $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  has been widely used among various inhomogeneous semiconductor photocatalysts due to its special properties such as mechanical and chemical stability, Eco-friendly, non-toxicity, low-cost synthesis and easy recovery (Madani et al. [2013](#page-10-11)).

Ambrosetti et al. showed the removal efficiency of Amoxicillin, Erythromycin, Streptomycin, Ciprofloxacin by photocatalysis with  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $ZnO$ . Amoxicillin, Erythromycin, Streptomycin, Ciprofoxacin was decomposed under UV and sunlight for 15 min. In each solution, 0.01 g of zinc oxide or 0.01 g of titanium dioxide was added. In comparison, Zinc oxide required much more time to degrade antibiotics than titanium dioxide (Ambrosetti et al. [2015\)](#page-9-6). The maximum removal rate of alachlor was estimated 98.44% from aqueous media using  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoparticles (NPs) under UV (Jamshidi et al. [2019](#page-10-12)). A study by Shokri et al. showed, 90% mineralization and 100% of degradation of chloramphenicol were obtained after 18 min of UV-C irradiation when (1 wt%)  $TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ag NPs$  were used (Shokri et al. [2013\)](#page-10-13). Furthermore, Under optimal operating conditions (pH 7; temperature 25 °C), complete degradation (approximately 100%) of oxytetracycline was achieved in 180 min (Calcio Gaudino et al. [2021\)](#page-9-7). Also, more than 95% of the Tetracycline (TC) antibiotic was removed within 40 min, 40 ppm of TC, and 1 g  $l^{-1}$  of TiO<sub>2</sub> under UV irradiation (Daghrir et al. [2013](#page-9-8)). According to the mentioned studies, the degradation of antibiotics can change depending on the conditions such as pH, temperature, reaction time, catalyst, and pollutant concentration. Therefore, in this study, for the frst time, diferent effective parameters of Vancomycin removal efficiency such as concentration of Vancomycin,  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  amount, pH, temperature and reaction time were investigated simultaneously using a multivariate approach based on Central Composite Design (CCD). Also, the optimum conditions were studied by considering the interaction efect of the parameters. Moreover, the Vancomycin degradation efficiency with and without UV radiation was considered and the effects of aeration and catalyst recovery under optimal conditions were investigated as well. This study was conducted at the school of health, Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Shiraz, Iran, 2019–2021.

### **Materials and methods**

#### **Chemicals and equipment**

Titanium tetrachloride  $(TiCl<sub>4</sub>)$  and hydrochloric acid (HCL) which were used for synthesizing  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  obtained from Merck Company (Germany). Vancomycin was prepared from Sigma Aldrich Company (USA) with purity greater than 80% HPLC grade (High Performance Liquid Chromatography). All standard samples and batch



experiments were prepared using deionized distilled water. Methanol and water used in chromatography analysis had "Chromatographic grade" from Merck Company (Germany).

To identify and detect Vancomycin in the samples, High-Performance Liquid Chromatography (HPLC) was used. KNAUER HPLC (AZURA model, Germany) was equipped by PDA UV–Vis Detector with a C18 column (Eurospher 100-5,  $250 \times 4$  mm—KNAUER) in reverse phase mode and using a mobile phase containing 30% ultrapure water and 70% methanol (70:30 V/V). The fow rate of the mobile phase was 1.2 ml min−1, and the UV detector was set at 229 nm wavelength for detection. A sample injection loop of 20 μl was used in the experiments and this loop was full during each injection. Before the injection, the samples were fltered by syringe flter cellulose acetate membrane with a pore size of 0.22 μm. The retention time of Vancomycin in the photocatalytic reaction was 2.36 min and the detection range of Vancomycin was in the concentration range of  $0.01-100$  mg  $l^{-1}$ .

### **Synthesis of TiO<sub>2</sub>**

 $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  white powder was obtained based on the method previously reported by Yener et al. ([2017](#page-11-1)). Briefy, 13.7 ml of TiCl<sub>4</sub> (0.5 M) was added to a 250 ml flask containing  $62.18$  ml of HCL  $(3 M)$ , to control the hydrolysis reaction. Reactions were carried under the hood because the reaction was highly thermogenic and caused a dense white cloud during the preparation of the  $TiCl<sub>4</sub>$  solution. The reaction vessel was placed in a cool water container. Then, the solution was stirred at 95 °C with 500 rpm for 3 h at room temperature. After completing the reaction, the yellow supernatants were separated and white precipitates were passed through the flter paper, and the remaining precipitates were washed several times by distilled water until neutralizing the acid suspension. The remaining white precipitant on the paper filter was placed in the oven at 60 °C for 1 day to be dried.

### **Characterization**

To determine the crystal structure and the crystalline size of the prepared nanocatalyst, the X-ray difraction (XRD) was used with the XRD Bruker  $D_8$  Advance powder diffractometer (Bruker, Germany) by applying the refection mode with Cu-K<sub>α</sub> radiation ( $\lambda$  = 1.5406 Å). ZEISS (SIGMA VP model, Germany) Field Emission Scanning Electron Microscope (FE-SEM) was used to analyze the morphology of nanostructures, and the energy-dispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDX) was applied to identify the chemical compounds.

#### **Reactor**

Vancomycin degradation and removal reactions were performed in an aqueous medium in a 250 ml glass reactor. The set-up of the temperature in the reaction was done by a hot water circulation in the reactor jacket to the desired temperature. During the test, a UV-C lamp (6 watts-230 v-254 nm) was placed in a quartz tube at the center of the reactor. Before starting the tests, temperature and pH were adjusted for diferent samples. HCl and NaOH were used to adjust the pH values whenever required. A magnetic stirrer was used during the tests. The reactor was placed in Aluminum foil to prevent visible light and ultraviolet light interference. The centrifuging of samples was done in the test tubes to separate the utilized nanocatalyst. Figure [1](#page-2-0) shows the reactor used in the study. The Vancomycin removal efficiency  $(E\%)$  was calculated from the following equation:

$$
E\left(\% \right) = \left(C_0 - C\right) / C_0 \times 100\tag{5}
$$

where  $C_0$  and  $C$  represent Vancomycin concentration before and after the TiO<sub>2</sub>/UV process, respectively.

### **The experimental parameters**

In this study, fve experimental parameters were studied and optimized in removal of Vancomycin which is represented as follows. Initial concentration of Vancomycin was 15, 30, 45, 60, 75 (mg  $l^{-1}$ ), TiO<sub>2</sub> dosage: 25, 50, 75, 100, 125 (mg), temperature: 25, 30, 35, 40, 45 (°C), pH: 3, 5, 7, 9, 11, and reaction time: 15, 30, 45, 60, 75 (min).



<span id="page-2-0"></span>**Fig. 1** Photochemical reactor used for removal of vancomycin



# **Experimental design**

Because of the limitations of one-at-a-time approaches (Jamshidi et al. [2019\)](#page-10-12) several multivariate experimental design methods for optimizing the effective parameters in the chemical processes have been proposed, among which Response Surface Methodology (RSM) is a well-known one. RSM is a set of mathematical and statistical methods for modeling and analyzing the problem. This method is used simultaneously to respond the problem (objective) by afecting several input independence variables and to optimize this response. In this method, the relationships between multiple or irrelevant variables are measured using the effect of independent variables. One of the most commonly used Response surface methods is the Central Composite Design (CCD), which is implemented at 5 levels (Aggarwal et al. [2008](#page-9-9)). Therefore, a central composite design was used to optimize and evaluate the efect of diferent performance parameters on the degradation process of Vancomycin by  $TiO<sub>2</sub>/UV$ . Here, a total of 42 experiments were designed using CCD to optimize the fve experimental variables (initial Vancomycin concentration,  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration, temperature, time, pH). In this design, fve levels were assumed for each variable which is presented in Table [1.](#page-3-0) The design of the experiments and analysis of variance and Multiple Linear Regression (MLR) was conducted using Design-Expert software (Stat-Ease Inc.) run on a PC with Windows 7 operating system.

# **Results and discussion**

# **Characterization using XRD**

Based on Fig. [2,](#page-3-1) characteristics difraction peaks were at 2*θ* equal to 69.9, 54.2, 43.9, 41.2, 36.1, and 27.4 were obtained which were in agreement with the pattern of the rutile form

<span id="page-3-0"></span>**Table 1** The parameters and levels used for the experimental design in removal of vancomycin



<span id="page-3-1"></span>



of  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$ . The characteristics peaks of other crystalline forms of TiO<sub>2</sub> NPs (Anatase and Brookite) were not observed in the obtained NPs. Based on the Scherrer equation, the average crystalline size of the prepared nanocatalyst was also calculated from the four sharpest peaks of the XRD pattern which was equal to 4.7 ( $\pm$ 0.2) nm.

### **SEM imaging**

The shape of  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  NPs was investigated by field emission scanning electron microscopy (FE-SEM). Accordingly,  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  NPs had spherical and granular shapes, as displayed in Fig. [3a](#page-4-0). The size of the nanoparticles ranged from 20 to 69 nm. Elemental analysis by EDX of TiO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles is shown in Fig. [3](#page-4-0)b as well. EDX showed that Ti content was 74.9% and the percentage of O and Cl were 24.3% and 0.8%, respectively.

### **CCD model**

Experimental parameters for Vancomycin degradation from aqueous solutions were optimized using the synthesized nanocomposites after their characterization and using the CCD experimental design. The utilized 42 runs suggested by CCD are shown in Table S1 (Supporting information). Table [2](#page-5-0) shows the Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) results of the model made based on the CCD method.

According to Table [2](#page-5-0), the parameters entered in the obtained equation based on the designed runs for Vancomycin degradation with  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  catalyst are pH (A), initial concentration of Vancomycin  $(B)$ , TiO<sub>2</sub> amount  $(C)$ , temperature (*D*), time (*E*). Also, pH and initial Vancomycin concentration interaction (*AB*), pH and temperature interaction (*AD*), initial concentration of Vancomycin and temperature interaction (*BD*), temperature and time interaction (*DE*), pH self-interaction  $(A^2)$ , initial concentration of Vancomycin self-interaction  $(B^2)$ , and time self-interaction  $(D^2)$ .

Based on these results, the obtained linear model after MLR regression analysis is shown in Eqs.  $(6)$  $(6)$  and  $(7)$  $(7)$  which shows the model based on the coded and original values of experimental parameters:

<span id="page-4-1"></span>Peak area = 
$$
237.15 - 9.467A + 76.43B - 14.27C
$$
  
+  $36.4D - 28.59E - 38.06AB - 16.55AD$   
+  $37.84BD + 18.49DE - 13.48A^2$   
-  $21.4B^2 - 28.7D^2 - 26.57E^2$  (6)

<span id="page-4-2"></span>Peak area = 
$$
-1674.5 + 157.5A + 4.87B - 0.57C
$$
  
+  $65.42D + 0.09E - 1.27AB - 1.65AD$   
+  $0.5BD + 0.24DE - 3.37A^2$  (7)  
-  $0.09B^2 - 1.14D2 - 0.11E^2$ 

In Eqs.  $(6)$  $(6)$  $(6)$  and  $(7)$  $(7)$  $(7)$ , the negative or positive signs or coefficients in the equation, indicate the negative (reverse) or positive (direct) effects of the parameters or the interaction terms on the Vancomycin peak area as an index for its removal efficiency. Due to the reverse relationship of Vancomycin and degradation efficiency, the parameters with a negative sign have a positive effect on the removal efficiency and so on. For an acceptable model,  $R^2$  should not be less than 0.75 (Moriasi et al.  $2015$ ) and the  $R^2$  of the suggested model was 0.92 and it was close to  $R^2_{\text{adj}} = 0.88$ .  $R^2_{\text{adj}}$  indicates the correlation between the value predicted by the model and the actual values under experimental conditions (Golbraikh and Tropsha [2000](#page-9-10)). Also, the correlation coefficient of prediction  $(R<sup>2</sup><sub>pred</sub>)$  was 0.81, which is more than 0.75, and indicates a signifcant relationship between the efective parameters and



<span id="page-4-0"></span>**Fig. 3** SEM image (**a**) and EDX elemental analysis (**b**) for the synthesized TiO<sub>2</sub>



Source	Sum of squares	Df	Mean Square	$F$ -value	$p$ value	
					Prob > F	
Model	391,481.4	13	30,113.96	25.18	< 0.0001	Significant
pH(A)	2869.71		2869.71	2.40	0.1325	
Initial concentration of vancomycin $(B)$	186,910.2		186,910.2	156.33	< 0.0001	
$TiO2$ amount $(C)$	6514.14	1	6514.14	5.44	0.0270	
Temp $(D)$	42,377.76		42,377.76	35.44	< 0.0001	
Time $(E)$	26,139.95		26,139.95	21.86	< 0.0001	
AB	23,177.93		23,177.93	19.38	0.0001	
AD	4384.42	1	4384.42	3.66	0.0658	
BD	22,912.88		22,912.88	19.16	0.0002	
DE	5473.04		5473.04	4.57	0.0412	
$A^2$	9127.60		9127.60	7.63	0.0100	
$B^2$	22,979.38		22,979.38	19.22	0.0001	
$D^2$	41,348.59		41,348.59	34.58	< 0.0001	
$E^2$	35,434.72		35,434.72	29.63	< 0.0001	
Residual	33,476.48	28	1195.58			
Lack of fit	22,363.37	13	1720.25	2.321932	0.0605	Not significant
C.V. %	<b>PRESS</b>	$R^2$	$R^2_{\text{adj}}$		$R^2_{\text{pred}}$	
16.91	80,659.57	0.92	0.88		0.81	

<span id="page-5-0"></span>**Table 2** Analysis of variance of diferent parameters using CCD method in vancomycin removal

responses (peak area) (Nikaeen et al. [2020](#page-10-15)). The signal-tonoise ratio of the Adequate Precision rate was 18.62, which indicates that the model has an appropriate signal. According to the literature, an adequate precision higher than four, indicates a precise and acceptable model (Variyana et al. [2019](#page-10-16)).

*F*-value is the ratio of the mean squares of the model or each parameter to the mean squares of the not ftted data. The *p* value indicates the probability of error in accepting the validity of the observed results. The lower the *p* value, the higher the accuracy. The smaller the *p* value and the larger the *F*-value shows more significant coefficients in the MLR model. Defned simply, a *p* value is a data-based measure that helps to show a departure from a specifed null hypothesis (Jamshidi et al. [2019\)](#page-10-12). The total *F*-value in this analysis was 25.18, which indicates the signifcance of the model. In this analysis, *B*, *C*, *D*, *E BD*, *AD DE*, *AB*, *A*<sup>2</sup> ,  $B^2$ ,  $D^2$ , and  $E^2$  were significant parameters (affecting the removal reaction) ( $p$  value < 0.1).

One of the methods used to identify the errors in the design of experiments is to plot the residual normal curve. Residual is the diference between the observation and the values of the prediction model of the dependent variable. For a statistically correct model, this value must be small and its distribution must be normal (Bruce and Bruce [2017](#page-9-11)). Figure [4](#page-6-0)a shows the normal plot of the Vancomycin removal process, indicating that about 98% of the experiments data have an error of less than 2.9 and only about 2% have an



error of more than−2.5. These are random errors and the appropriate distribution confrms the model developed for Vancomycin removal, using  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  catalyst. The distribution of residual values in diferent peak areas (as the indicator of removal of Vancomycin from aqueous media using a  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$ catalyst) versus the actual value is shown in Fig. [4b](#page-6-0). The distribution of the residual values on both sides of the axial line does not show a pattern on one side of the zero lines. It is clear that the residual values in these diagrams have no special or unusual pattern and thus no systematic error can be detected and the model is valid. Figure [4c](#page-6-0) also shows the random distribution of the residual value, similar to Fig. [4b](#page-6-0), but here the residuals are represented in diferent runs. As it was denoted previously, distribution in both sides of the zero line confrms the absence of systematic errors in removal experiments (Nekoeinia et al. [2015\)](#page-10-17). Also, as it is represented in Fig. [4](#page-6-0)d, there is a good consistency between the actual peak area and the predicted value of the model in the removal process of Vancomycin.

# **Response surface of interaction factors**

To investigate the effect of various interaction factors (independent variables) on the degradation of Vancomycin (dependent variable), three-dimensional (3D) surface representations of the interaction terms are illustrated in Fig. [5.](#page-7-0) Figure [5](#page-7-0)a shows the 3D plot of the interaction between pH and the initial concentration of Vancomycin. As observed in



<span id="page-6-0"></span>**Fig. 4** Normal probability plot of the studentised residual (**a**), the residual plot versus predicted response (**b**), the residual plot versus diferent runs (**c**), predicted response values versus their actual values (**d**)

Fig. [5a](#page-7-0), as the initial concentration of Vancomycin increases, the peak area of chromatograms also increases and the amount of antibiotic elimination decreases.

The 3D surface of the effect of pH and temperature on the Vancomycin peak is shown in Fig. [5b](#page-7-0). As can be observed, with increasing temperature, the amount of peak area increased and the removal of Vancomycin using  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  decreased. As the pH increases from 5 to 9, the peak area also is slightly increases. This means that the Vancomycin removal efficiency was done better at acidic pH around 5 in comparison with higher and alkaline pH. Malakootian showed that the removal of ciprofoxacin was inversely related to pH (Malakootian et al. [2020](#page-10-18)). Also, Peterson showed that the  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  catalyst removed penicillin from the





<span id="page-7-0"></span>**Fig. 5** Three-dimensional response surface plots of interaction: interaction between pH and initial concentration of vancomycin (**a**), interaction of pH and temperature (**b**), interaction of initial concentration of vancomycin and temperature (**c**), interaction of temperature and time (**d**)

aqueous solutions and the highest removal rate were at pH values 4 to 6 (Peterson et al. [2012\)](#page-10-19).

It was observed that the removal of antibiotics was strongly dependent on pH (Kebede et al. [2019](#page-10-20)). Because it has a great effect on the production of hydroxyl radicals, the solubility of contaminants and catalyst surface charge play an important role in the decomposition and removal of antibiotics (Bagal and Gogate [2012;](#page-9-12) Daghrir et al. [2013\)](#page-9-8). The surface charge properties of  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  change with pH. Surface charge TiO<sub>2</sub> at  $pH = 6.5$  was zero and was positive in acidic solution and negative in alkaline solution (Liu et al. [2007](#page-10-21)).

It has been reported that Vancomycin has 6 pKa values: 7.75, 8.89 (basic), 2.18, 9.59, 10.4, and 12.0 (acidic) (Jia et al. [2013](#page-10-22)). Thus, in pH values between 2.2 and 7.7, the Vancomycin has not intensive positive or negative charge; thus, it has a little repulsive effect with  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  surface which can increase the interaction of drug with nano-catalyst and increase the removal efficiency.

Muruganandham et al. showed that the reaction rates of phorate decomposition were relatively independent of solution temperature and pH values (Muruganandham et al. [2014\)](#page-10-23) Degradation of β-lactam antibiotics (Penicillin and Cephalosporins) increases with increasing temperature (Roca et al. [2011\)](#page-10-24). Figure [5](#page-7-0)c shows the trend of change in the peak area, as a function of the initial concentration of Vancomycin and temperature. The interaction between the initial concentration of Vancomycin and temperature is effective on the removal of Vancomycin ( $p$  value < 0.1). As shown in Fig. [5a](#page-7-0), high concentrations of contaminants can form intermediates. These compounds can capture OH radicals in side reactions and also can be adsorbed by the catalyst surface which can lead to a decrease in the active surface of the catalyst. In the situation of surface, the catalyst was not able to absorb the active form  $OH^0$ ,  $H_2O$ ,  $O_2$  sufficiently. This condition reduces the reaction with capacitance holes and conduction band electrons produced by the catalyst.



In addition, in an environment with high concentrations of pollutants, fewer photons reach the catalyst surface, which reduces the optical activity (Farzadkia et al. [2014\)](#page-9-13).

Figure [5](#page-7-0)d shows the effect of reaction time and temperature on the peak area of Vancomycin as the indicator of the removal process which was obtained at a concentration of 45 mg  $1^{-1}$  Vancomycin and pH = 7 using TiO<sub>2</sub> dose equal to 75 mg. As observed in this fg, with increasing temperature, the peak area increases, and the antibiotic removal rate is decreased. With increasing the reaction time, the peak area decreases and the removal efficiency increases. It should be emphasized that the above discussion is used to show that the total trends and optimum value of all parameters cannot be reached solely by considering these plots. In better words, the optimum value will be obtained by considering all the parameters simultaneously and using a multivariate approach.

### **Vancomycin removal efficiency under optimal conditions**

After analyzing the model and obtaining the optimum values of experimental parameters of Vancomycin removal using simplex approach, the optimum conditions was calculated as:  $pH = 5.1$ , initial concentration of Vancomycin = 58.2 mg  $1^{-1}$ , TiO<sub>2</sub> dosage = 54.9 mg in 250 ml reactor, temperature=39.6 °C, and reaction time=36.3 min. In these conditions, the removal efficiency was evaluated in the presence of TiO<sub>2</sub> nanocatalyst so that the removal efficiency with UV radiation and without it, was 89.5% and 25%, respectively. In the same vein, Safari et al. stated that the removal of tetracycline was  $83.2\%$  by TiO<sub>2</sub>/UV and  $23.8\%$  by presence of UV alone. With  $TiO<sub>2</sub>/UV$ , more hydroxyl ions are formed in solution and antibiotic decomposition occurs faster. (Safari et al. [2015\)](#page-10-25). Kim and Tanaka also found that two UV lamps were more efective at removing pharmaceuticals and personal care products than one UV lamp. Two UV lamps Photolyze more water molecules and produce more hydroxyl (Kim and Tanaka [2009\)](#page-10-26). Increasing the initial concentration of the pollutant may reduce the performance of the UV rays to reach the  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  level because the ultraviolet light is reduced or scattered by fne solid particles (Chong et al. [2009;](#page-9-14) Jamshidi et al. [2019\)](#page-10-12). Jamshidi et al. also showed that under the optimum conditions (alachlor concentration of 30 mg  $1^{-1}$ , TiO<sub>2</sub> concentration of 100 mg  $1^{-1}$ , temperature of 35 °C, reaction time of 60 min), removal of alachlor was 98.44% (Jamshidi et al. [2019\)](#page-10-12). Lofrano et al. showed the degradation of Vancomycin in the presence of  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  (0.1) and 0.2 g) was obtained 95–85% for 120 min. (Lofrano et al.

[2014](#page-10-6)). In addition, Lofrano et al. investigated the degradation of Vancomycin in the presence of  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  and ZnO with initial concentrations; 20–50 mg  $l^{-1}$  for Vancomycin and 0.1 and 0.5  $g l^{-1}$  for TiO<sub>2</sub> and ZnO at normal pH. Therefore the Vancomycin removal came to 70–85% in 10 min by ZnO and  $73-59\%$  in 90 min by TiO<sub>2</sub> (Lofrano et al. [2018](#page-10-27)). In comparison, this study revealed that more degradation efficiency  $(89.5\%)$  was achieved by optimizing the conditions in a lower amount of catalyst (54.9 mg) and lower time  $(36.3 \text{ min})$  in the presence of TiO<sub>2</sub>/UV. Thus, Vancomycin removal efficiency for real wastewater sample under optimal conditions was 84%.

## **Vancomycin removal efficiency under optimal conditions in the presence or absence of aeration**

As a fact, stirring of liquids increases the photocatalytic reaction by increasing the rate of aeration and oxygenation of the solution, in addition, increasing the aeration rate can lead to a decrease in the resistance of external mass transfer and performing light degradation (Chong et al. [2009](#page-9-14)). To show the role of aeration in the suggested process, airing was done in the mentioned optimized conditions, so the removal efficiency of Vancomycin was increased by aeration (93%).

#### **Catalyst recovery and reuse**

To investigate the catalyst recycling, the experiments was performed based on the optimal conditions for this purpose, the catalyst was checked at the end of the run by centrifuging, and washing several times with distilled water; then, it was dried at 60 °C and reused in another similar cycle, i.e., Vancomycin removal. After performing two cycles, the degradation efficiency was decreased from  $89.5$  to  $80\%$  in the former step and to 78% in the latter. Accumulation of pollutants on the surface of the catalyst can cause a partial blocking on active sites of the catalyst and reducing the absorption of light by the catalyst and decreasing the hydroxyl radicals production (Argyle and Bartholomew [2015\)](#page-9-15). As the result, the catalyst potential for removing vancomycin was slightly changed during the two runs.

### **Conclusion**

The results showed the efficiency of the application of  $TiO<sub>2</sub>/$ UV on the degradation of vancomycin in the aqueous media. In this study for the frst time, the various afecting parameters on the photocatalytic degradation of vancomycin were explored simultaneously using a multivariate approach based on CCD. ANOVA results of the model made based on the CCD method showed,  $R^2$  of the final model was 0.92, which was close to  $R^2_{\text{adj}}$  (0.88). This showed a correlation between the predicted and the actual response values. The results showed, various parameters such as, initial concentration of vancomycin,  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  amount, pH, temperature and reaction time can signifcantly infuence the photocatalytic degradation of vancomycin. Optimization is important for photocatalytic degradation process for large scale application. Overall, the optimal conditions for vancomycin removal  $(89.5\%)$  were as follows:  $pH = 5.1$ , initial concentration of vancomycin = 58.2 mg  $l^{-1}$ , TiO<sub>2</sub> dosage = 54.9 mg, temperature = 39.6 °C, and time = 36.3 min. According to the results, vancomycin degradation was decreased with increasing temperature and initial vancomycin concentration. Also, the degradation efficiency was increased with decreasing pH and increasing reaction time. Furthermore, under optimal conditions, vancomycin efficiency can be increased by aeration and the use of ultraviolet radiation with a catalyst. The results obtained from the optimal conditions help to eliminate vancomycin in real conditions especially the wastewater of the pharmaceutical industries. It could be suggested that such multivariate optimization is a good way to obtain acceptable efficiency for vancomycin elimination in the aqueous media.

**Supplementary Information** The online version contains supplementary material available at<https://doi.org/10.1007/s13762-022-04117-8>.

**Acknowledgements** This article was extracted from the thesis written by Fatemeh Dehghani Ph.D. student in Environmental Engineering. We would like to appreciate the fnancial support of the Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University (IAU), Tehran, Iran, and the laboratory facilities of the School of Health, Shiraz University of Medical Sciences. The cooperation of Ms. Shima Bahrami and the support of Dr. Reza Sadeghi are also appreciated. The authors would like to thank Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Shiraz, Iran and also Center for Development of Clinical Research of Nemazee Hospital and Dr. Nasrin Shokrpour for editorial assistance.

### **Declarations**

**Conflict of interest** The authors declare no confict of interest.

**Ethical approval** This article does not contain any studies with human participants or animals performed by any of the authors.

#### **References**

- <span id="page-9-0"></span>Abutaleb NS et al (2021) In vitro and in vivo activities of the carbonic anhydrase inhibitor, dorzolamide, against vancomycin-resistant enterococci. PeerJ 9:e11059. <https://doi.org/10.7717/peerj.11059>
- <span id="page-9-9"></span>Aggarwal A et al (2008) Optimizing power consumption for CNC turned parts using response surface methodology and Taguchi's technique—a comparative analysis. J Mater Process Technol 200(1–3):373–384. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmatprotec.2007.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmatprotec.2007.09.041) [09.041](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmatprotec.2007.09.041)
- <span id="page-9-6"></span>Ambrosetti B, Campanella L, Palmisano R (2015) Degradation of antibiotics in aqueous solution by photocatalytic process: comparing the efficiency in the use of ZnO or TiO<sub>2</sub>. J Environ Sci Eng A 4(6):243–281.<https://doi.org/10.17265/2162-5298/2015.06.001>
- <span id="page-9-1"></span>Antunes M, Arsand D, Colvara W (2017) Degradation of vancomycin hydrochloride by electrooxidation. Modern Chem Appl 05(03):2. <https://doi.org/10.4172/2329-6798.1000230>
- <span id="page-9-15"></span>Argyle M, Bartholomew C (2015) Heterogeneous catalyst deactivation and regeneration: a review. Catalysts 5(1):145–269. [https://](https://doi.org/10.3390/catal5010145) [doi.org/10.3390/catal5010145](https://doi.org/10.3390/catal5010145)
- <span id="page-9-12"></span>Bagal MV, Gogate PR (2012) Sonochemical degradation of alachlor in the presence of process intensifying additives. Sep Purif Technol 90:92–100. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2012.02.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2012.02.019) [019](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2012.02.019)
- <span id="page-9-11"></span>Bruce P, Bruce A (2017) Practical statistics for data scientists. O'Reilly Media, Inc., Newton
- <span id="page-9-7"></span>Calcio Gaudino E et al (2021) Degradation of antibiotics in wastewater: new advances in cavitational treatments. Molecules 26(3):617. <https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules26030617>
- <span id="page-9-3"></span>Cao M et al (2018) Studies on the metabolism and degradation of vancomycin in simulated in vitro and aquatic environment by UHPLC-Triple-TOF-MS/MS. Sci Rep 8(1):15471. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-018-33826-9) [org/10.1038/s41598-018-33826-9](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-018-33826-9)
- <span id="page-9-14"></span>Chong MN et al (2009) Optimisation of an annular photoreactor process for degradation of Congo Red using a newly synthesized titania impregnated kaolinite nano-photocatalyst. Sep Purif Technol 67(3):355–363.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2009.04.001>
- <span id="page-9-4"></span>Cycoń M et al (2016) An analysis of the efects of vancomycin and/or vancomycin-resistant *Citrobacter freundii* exposure on the microbial community structure in soil. Front Microbiol 7:1015. [https://](https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2016.01015) [doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2016.01015](https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2016.01015)
- <span id="page-9-8"></span>Daghrir R, Drogui P, El Khakani MA (2013) Photoelectrocatalytic oxidation of chlortetracycline using  $Ti/TiO<sub>2</sub>$  photo-anode with simultaneous H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> production. Electrochim Acta 87:18-31. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.electacta.2012.09.020) [org/10.1016/j.electacta.2012.09.020](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.electacta.2012.09.020)
- <span id="page-9-2"></span>Dinu V et al (2020) The antibiotic vancomycin induces complexation and aggregation of gastrointestinal and submaxillary mucins. Sci Rep 10(1):960.<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-57776-3>
- <span id="page-9-13"></span>Farzadkia M et al (2014) Investigation of photocatalytic degradation of clindamycin antibiotic by using nano-ZnO catalysts. Korean J Chem Eng 31(11):2014–2019. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11814-014-0119-y) [s11814-014-0119-y](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11814-014-0119-y)
- <span id="page-9-5"></span>Fazilati M (2019) Photocatalytic degradation of amoxicillin, cephalexin, and tetracycline from aqueous solution: comparison of efficiency in the usage of TiO<sub>2</sub>, ZnO, or GO-Fe<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> nanoparticles. Desalin Water Treatment 169:222–231. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.5004/dwt.2019.24632) [5004/dwt.2019.24632](https://doi.org/10.5004/dwt.2019.24632)
- <span id="page-9-10"></span>Golbraikh A, Tropsha A (2000) Predictive QSAR modeling based on diversity sampling of experimental datasets for the training and



test set selection. Mol Divers 5(4):231–243. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1021372108686) [1023/A:1021372108686](https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1021372108686)

- <span id="page-10-3"></span>Herrero IA, Issa NC, Patel R (2002) Nosocomial spread of linezolidresistant, vancomycin-resistant *Enterococcus faecium*. N Engl J Med 346(11):867–869. [https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJM200203](https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJM200203143461121) [143461121](https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJM200203143461121)
- <span id="page-10-8"></span>Hocquet D, Muller A, Bertrand X (2016) What happens in hospitals does not stay in hospitals: antibiotic-resistant bacteria in hospital wastewater systems. J Hosp Infect 93(4):395–402. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhin.2016.01.010) [10.1016/j.jhin.2016.01.010](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhin.2016.01.010)
- <span id="page-10-12"></span>Jamshidi F et al (2019) Photocatalytic degradation of alachlor by  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$ nanoparticles from aqueous solutions under UV radiation. J Exp Nanosci 14(1):116–128. [https://doi.org/10.1080/17458080.2019.](https://doi.org/10.1080/17458080.2019.1677891) [1677891](https://doi.org/10.1080/17458080.2019.1677891)
- <span id="page-10-22"></span>Jia Z et al (2013) Vancomycin: ligand recognition, dimerization and super-complex formation. FEBS J 280(5):1294–1307. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1111/febs.12121) [org/10.1111/febs.12121](https://doi.org/10.1111/febs.12121)
- <span id="page-10-20"></span>Kebede T, Dube S, Nindi M (2019) Removal of multi-class antibiotic drugs from wastewater using water-soluble protein of *Moringa stenopetala* seeds. Water 11(3):595. [https://doi.org/10.3390/](https://doi.org/10.3390/w11030595) [w11030595](https://doi.org/10.3390/w11030595)
- <span id="page-10-26"></span>Kim I, Tanaka H (2009) Photodegradation characteristics of PPCPs in water with UV treatment. Environ Int 35(5):793–802. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2009.01.003) [org/10.1016/j.envint.2009.01.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2009.01.003)
- <span id="page-10-10"></span>Kurt A et al (2017) Treatment of antibiotics in wastewater using advanced oxidation processes (AOPs). In: Farooq R, Ahmad Z (eds) Physico-chemical wastewater treatment and resource recovery. InTech, London. <https://doi.org/10.5772/67538>
- <span id="page-10-21"></span>Liu SX, Chen XY, Chen X (2007) A  $TiO<sub>2</sub>/AC$  composite photocatalyst with high activity and easy separation prepared by a hydrothermal method. J Hazard Mater 143(1–2):257–263. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2006.09.026) [10.1016/j.jhazmat.2006.09.026](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2006.09.026)
- <span id="page-10-6"></span>Lofrano G et al (2014) An integrated chemical and ecotoxicological assessment for the photocatalytic degradation of vancomycin. Environ Technol 35(10):1234–1242. [https://doi.org/10.1080/](https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2013.865085) [09593330.2013.865085](https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2013.865085)
- <span id="page-10-27"></span>Lofrano G et al  $(2018)$  Comparison of TiO<sub>2</sub> and ZnO catalysts for heterogenous photocatalytic removal of vancomycin B. Adv Environ Res 7(3):213–223
- <span id="page-10-11"></span>Madani M et al (2013) PS/TiO<sub>2</sub> (polystyrene/titanium dioxide) composite nanofbers with higher surface-to-volume ratio prepared by electrospinning: morphology and thermal properties. Polym Eng Sci 53(11):2407–2412.<https://doi.org/10.1002/pen.23493>
- <span id="page-10-18"></span>Malakootian M, Nasiri A, Amiri Gharaghani M (2020) Photocatalytic degradation of ciprofloxacin antibiotic by  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoparticles immobilized on a glass plate. Chem Eng Commun 207(1):56–72. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00986445.2019.1573168>
- <span id="page-10-0"></span>Martens E, Demain AL (2017) An overview of the industrial aspects of antibiotic discovery. In: Kurtböke I (ed) Microbial resources. Elsevier, Amsterdam, pp 149–168. [https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-](https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-804765-1.00007-2) [0-12-804765-1.00007-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-804765-1.00007-2)
- <span id="page-10-5"></span>Melese A, Genet C, Andualem T (2020) Prevalence of Vancomycin resistant enterococci (VRE) in Ethiopia: a systematic review and

meta-analysis. BMC Infect Dis 20(1):124. [https://doi.org/10.1186/](https://doi.org/10.1186/s12879-020-4833-2) [s12879-020-4833-2](https://doi.org/10.1186/s12879-020-4833-2)

- <span id="page-10-14"></span>Moriasi D et al (2015) Hydrologic and water quality models: performance measures and evaluation criteria. Trans ASABE 58(6):1763–1785.<https://doi.org/10.13031/trans.58.10715>
- <span id="page-10-23"></span>Muruganandham M et al (2014) Recent developments in homogeneous advanced oxidation processes for water and wastewater treatment. Int J Photoenergy 2014:1–21. [https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/](https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/821674) [821674](https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/821674)
- <span id="page-10-17"></span>Nekoeinia M, Yousefnejad S, Abdollahi-Dezaki A (2015) Prediction of E T N polarity scale of ionic liquids using a QSPR approach. Ind Eng Chem Res 54(50):12682–12689. [https://doi.org/10.1021/](https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.iecr.5b02982) [acs.iecr.5b02982](https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.iecr.5b02982)
- <span id="page-10-15"></span>Nikaeen G et al (2020) Central composite design for optimizing the biosynthesis of silver nanoparticles using *Plantago major* extract and investigating antibacterial, antifungal and antioxidant activity. Sci Rep 10(1):9642.<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-66357-3>
- <span id="page-10-2"></span>Nishiyama M et al (2017) Antibiotic resistance profling and genotyping of vancomycin-resistant Enterococci collected from an urban river basin in the Provincial City of Miyazaki, Japan. Water 9(2):79. <https://doi.org/10.3390/w9020079>
- <span id="page-10-19"></span>Peterson JW et al (2012) Adsorption and breakdown of penicillin antibiotic in the presence of titanium oxide nanoparticles in water. Chemosphere 87(8):911–917. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemo](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2012.01.044) [sphere.2012.01.044](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2012.01.044)
- <span id="page-10-1"></span>Piezzi V et al (2020) Increasing proportion of vancomycin resistance among enterococcal bacteraemias in Switzerland: a 6-year nation-wide surveillance, 2013 to 2018. Eurosurveillance 25(35):1900375. [https://doi.org/10.2807/1560-7917.ES.2020.](https://doi.org/10.2807/1560-7917.ES.2020.25.35.1900575) [25.35.1900575](https://doi.org/10.2807/1560-7917.ES.2020.25.35.1900575)
- <span id="page-10-7"></span>Qiu P et al (2016) Occurrence, fate, and risk assessment of vancomycin in two typical pharmaceutical wastewater treatment plants in Eastern China. Environ Sci Pollut Res 23(16):16513–16523. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-016-6676-3) [doi.org/10.1007/s11356-016-6676-3](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-016-6676-3)
- <span id="page-10-24"></span>Roca M et al (2011) Effect of heat treatments on stability of β-lactams in milk. J Dairy Sci 94(3):1155–1164. [https://doi.org/10.3168/](https://doi.org/10.3168/jds.2010-3599) [jds.2010-3599](https://doi.org/10.3168/jds.2010-3599)
- <span id="page-10-25"></span>Safari GH et al (2015) Photocatalytic degradation of tetracycline using nanosized titanium dioxide in aqueous solution. Int J Environ Sci Technol 12(2):603–616. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s13762-014-0706-9) [s13762-014-0706-9](https://doi.org/10.1007/s13762-014-0706-9)
- <span id="page-10-13"></span>Shokri M et al (2013) Photocatalytic degradation of chloramphenicol in an aqueous suspension of silver-doped  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoparticles. Environ Technol 34(9):1161–1166. [https://doi.org/10.1080/09593](https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2012.743589) [330.2012.743589](https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2012.743589)
- <span id="page-10-9"></span>Sib E et al (2019) Antibiotic resistant bacteria and resistance genes in bioflms in clinical wastewater networks. Int J Hyg Environ Health 222(4):655–662. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijheh.2019.03.006>
- <span id="page-10-4"></span>Varela AR et al (2013) Vancomycin resistant enterococci: from the hospital effluent to the urban wastewater treatment plant. Sci Total Environ 450–451:155–161. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scito](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2013.02.015) [tenv.2013.02.015](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2013.02.015)
- <span id="page-10-16"></span>Variyana Y, Muchammad RSC, Mahfud M (2019) Box-behnken design for the optimization using solvent-free microwave gravity

extraction of garlic oil from *Allium sativum* L. IOP Conf Ser Mater Sci Eng 673:012005. [https://doi.org/10.1088/1757-899X/](https://doi.org/10.1088/1757-899X/673/1/012005) [673/1/012005](https://doi.org/10.1088/1757-899X/673/1/012005)

- <span id="page-11-0"></span>Wei T et al (2020) Mitigation of antibiotic resistance in a pilot-scale system treating wastewater from high-speed railway trains. Chemosphere 245:125484. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.125484) [2019.125484](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.125484)
- <span id="page-11-1"></span>Yener HB et al (2017) Clinoptilolite supported rutile  $TiO<sub>2</sub>$  composites: synthesis, characterization, and photocatalytic activity on the degradation of terephthalic acid. Sep Purif Technol 173:17–26. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2016.09.010>

